

The Minutes of the Regular Meeting of the Parkersburg Utility Board

March 3, 2020

CALL TO ORDER

Pursuant to the call of its Chairman Tom Joyce, the Parkersburg Utility Board met in the Parkersburg Utility Board Administration Building, at 125 19th Street on the 3rd day of March, 2020. Chairman Joyce called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

Roll Call

Present:

Tom Joyce, Chairman
John Lutz, Vice Chairman
Gregory Herrick, Board Member
Paul Hoblitzell, Board Member
Robert Wright, Board Member
Jeff Reed, Counsel
Eric Bennett, Manager
Erin Hall, Comptroller
Christopher Pauley, Assistant Comptroller

Absent:

Others in Attendance:

Consideration of Minutes

Chairman Joyce requested the Board consider the minutes of the February 18, 2020 regular Board meeting for acceptance into the record.

Motion and Vote

Robert Wright moved to dispense with the reading of the minutes and approve the minutes of the February 18th meeting as presented to the Board. Paul Hoblitzell seconded the motion and it was approved by a unanimous vote of the Board members.

Consideration of
Financial Statements for Period Ending 12/31/2019

Hall stated as of the end of December we are 50% through the fiscal year and revenues are at 50.4% and expenditures are at 47.6% of the budget, and a combined debt service ratio of 1.434.

Motion and Vote

Greg Herrick moved to accept the financial statements for period ending 12/31/2019 as presented to the Board. Paul Hoblitzell seconded the motion and it was approved by a unanimous vote of the Board members.

Consideration of Revision to Policy for Purchasing and Bidding

Bennett stated Board members were provided a correspondence describing the revisions made along with a copy of the policy showing the exact revisions that were made. Bennett questioned if Board members wanted him to review every change or simply answer any questions they may have.

Joyce referenced the language under the Award Process section, specifically items 2 and 3 stating “The ability to promptly perform the contract or provide the commodity or service required” and “The character, integrity, reputation, judgement, experience and efficiency of the bidder”. Joyce questioned if PUB had ever disqualified a bidder prior to bidding. Joyce stated that from his experience if you have had a bad result or bad experience previously with a contractor, or it could have been related to work they had performed for some other entity, it is best to exclude those contractors by notifying them before bids are requested.

Joyce further stated that in the case of a three million dollar sanitary sewer construction contract the contract requirements would be very specific, as well as requiring ample references including past projects, cost, budget, change orders, completion times, all to allow determination if they are a capable and responsive contractor.

Joyce stated the City has disqualified one bidder for poor performance and two others for having a history of extensive change orders. Joyce stated you can disqualify a bidder if there is a history with that contractor of submitting a low bid and then requesting multiple change orders to complete the project. Joyce stated disqualifying a bidder after they submit the lowest bid is difficult. Bennett stated he was thinking of a process that could be utilized in the future.

Bennett also stated that West Virginia has a debarred vendors list but he is not sure the process utilized to get placed on the list so he will look into that process. Hoblitzell stated we could possibly disqualify contractors following the pre-bid meeting.

Joyce stated the State has criteria to get on that list and performance measures to be taken to get off the list. Joyce further stated that if we ever accept a bid from a contractor or vendor that has previously performed very poorly or provided a substandard product we failed our customers and are not doing our jobs. Bennett stated all contractors have issues of one kind or another. Hoblitzell stated the worst contractor we had was tank painter. Bennett agreed the painter hired to perform painting of the WTP clarifiers was a problem and would not be hired to perform any work in the future. Bennett also stated one of the better contractors was actually the firm that painted the north reservoirs.

Herrick stated he had never heard of disqualifying a bidder before bids are received. Joyce stated you are ahead to do it upfront before bids are received. Wright stated there would have to be criteria for such an action to be taken. Joyce agreed there would have to be criteria in place.

Joyce stated where government and private organizations get in trouble is when they receive a low bid from a company they don't like, for valid reasons, and they award the bid to a higher bidder. Hoblitzell questioned if we always knew who was bidding. Bennett stated we would know who had purchased or was mailed a bid package. Joyce stated every bid package should include standard language that clearly states PUB's rights and abilities in dealing with bidders and bids.

Bennett stated PUB had previously rejected a low bidder and selected the next low bidder. That was done because of references and knowledge of substandard work and ability to complete our project due to the complexity of portions of the sewer replacement project. Bennett stated that had been approximately 16 years ago and there were threats of suit but none were filed.

Wright stated he agreed with Joyce that each package should include standard language. Herrick stated he believed that was already the case. Bennett stated that we have standard language in every bid but he is in the process of making a standard packet that will be included with every bid to insure nothing is omitted.

Joyce questioned our ability to piggyback on State bids. Bennett stated that policy was part of the reasoning for the PUB purchasing policy. Joyce asked how much was done. Bennett stated very little was done and at this point he thought only the uniform service was under a community consortium group bid. Bennett stated in the past we could have purchased a loader on a piggyback, but the way the law was written the ability has to be included in the organization's purchasing policy. PUB had no written policy at that time. PUB still got the loader at state bid price but we had to advertise for bids for the equipment.

Joyce questioned why we were not doing more piggybacking. Bennett stated he had some previous conversations with State purchasing employees and did not receive much assistance, so we have continued to receive bids or quotes as has been done in the past. Bennett stated he would look into it but was unsure where to get a list of bid prices. Joyce stated he would have City Finance Director Eric Jiles provide that information.

Bennett stated he would review the State's policy on disqualification of bidders and discuss it with Mr. Reed and would bring something back to the Board related to that matter. Bennett questioned if there were any other issues that need discussed.

Motion and Vote

Paul Hoblitzell moved to approve the revisions to the Policy for Purchasing and Bidding as submitted. Robert Wright seconded the motion and it was approved with a unanimous vote of the Board members.

Consideration of Invoices in Excess of \$750

The following invoices totaling \$291,231.93 were considered for approval:

Atlas Towing	18.71 tons #57, 28.32 tons 1/2 crusher run and 40.32 pit run- sewer maint.	1,316.47
Burgess & Niple	Services during construction- Garfield Ave. thru January 31, 2020	2,071.23
Burgess & Niple	Professional services thru January 31, 2020-Water System Improvements	2,479.00
Burgess & Niple	Professional services thru January 31, 2020-Water System Improvements- Design	12,862.38
Burgess & Niple	Professional services thru January 31, 2020- Storage Tank Inspections	12,014.13
Burgess & Niple	Professional services thru January 31, 2020- Worthington Lane- Sewer Extension	2,001.50
Continental Utility Solutions	Billing Software- Payment #2	89,725.00
CWS	Canon copy/scan/fax machine- admin	7,950.00
Estabrook	Transducer for final effluent pumps- WWTP	1,227.30
Ferguson Waterworks	20- elbows, 3- 4" repair clamps- water maint.	904.48
Ferguson Waterworks	10- 6" repair clamps- water maint.	1,008.90
Frontier	Phone service - February 2020	967.73
JCI Jones Chemical	3076 gal of Hypochlorite Solution- WWTP	2,522.32
MonPower	Neal Run Pump Station - February 2020	985.89
MonPower	6th St. Pump Station - February 2020	6,802.59
MonPower	1st. Ave. Pump Station - February 2020	5,036.93
MonPower	Water Treatment Plant - February 2020	17,211.83
Pace Analytical	1st quarter water testing- WTP	904.85
Pace Analytical	1st quarter water testing- WWTP	1,067.88
Pipelines, Inc.	35- 5/8" coppersetter- water maint.	5,565.00
Pipelines, Inc.	14- 5/8" coppersetter- water maint.	2,470.58
Retiree Health Benefit Trust Fund	Contribution for retired employee health insurance - February 2020	12,039.26
Smith Concrete	10 yds. of 9 bag 2% Hi-Early concrete, 10 yds. cold weather operations - water maint.	1,510.00
Strand Associates, Inc.	Professional services thru January 31, 2020 - Misc. & Computer Services	3,374.69
Strand Associates, Inc.	Professional services thru January 31, 2020 - SSO Abatement Report	7,528.09
Stuart Oil Co.	519 gallons diesel - all depts.	1,209.78
Stuart Oil Co.	801 gallons unleaded- all depts.	1,847.90
Stuart Oil Co.	350 gallons unleaded- all depts.	784.32
US Postmaster	Postage for postage machine- admin	2,500.00
Walker Machinery	6- pad, 4- latch, 4- gaskets, seal, 2- latch kits- 12-102- sewer maint.	2,144.37
WVPEIA	Employee Health Insurance - February 2020	55,407.06
WVPERs	Pension expense - February 2020	25,790.47
	TOTAL APPROVED	291,231.93
Total amount of checks paid from sewer operating fund February 14- February 27, 2020		216,472.95
	Check #82488-82602	

Motion and Vote

Greg Herrick moved the list of invoices over \$750, dated March 3, 2020 in the amount of \$291,231.93 be approved for payment as submitted to the Board. John Lutz seconded the motion and it was approved with a unanimous vote of the Board members.

Other Business

Hoblitzell questioned if we had looked into the Fort Boreman water and sewer as requested by the County Commission. Bennett stated he needs to review the existing plans to insure they are still relevant and update the estimate, after that he will get with Fred Rader to discuss options.

Next Meeting Date

Erin Hall stated the next regular meeting would be March 17, 2020.

Board members agreed to meet in regular session, at the Parkersburg Utility Board Administration Building in the conference room, at 9:00 a.m. on March 17, 2020.

Adjournment

John Lutz moved the meeting be adjourned. Paul Hoblitzell seconded the motion and it was approved by a unanimous vote of the Board members. The meeting adjourned at 9:25 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

Eric Bennett, General Manager